

PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD

MONDAY, FEBRUARY 25, 2002

3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members Borys, Clement, Kreider, Senhauser, Raser, Spraul-Schmidt, and Wallace present. Members absent: Bloomfield and Sullebarger.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 316 PIKE STREET. LYTLE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Urban Conservator William Forwood presented the staff report for a COA for a major building expansion as well as exterior repair work to the Taft Museum. Mr. Forwood indicated that the project had been substantially revised since the HCB conducted a preliminary design review of this project at its June 11, 2001 meeting. On January 17, 2002, a committee of the HCB met with the architects to review the revised design presented today.

Mr. Forwood said that when the Board first reviewed this project, it was anticipated that the City would allocate federal funds to the construction of the parking garage. No such funding is now in place; therefore, no Section 106 review is required. He suggested the HCB review the project as a whole in the event public funding would be forthcoming next year.

Mr. Forwood reminded the Board that the Lytle Park Historic District guidelines address alterations and new construction in Area A (which includes the Taft Museum) visible from Lytle Park. The stone retaining wall and non-contributing garage proposed for demolition are in Area B, a section of the district not visible from Lytle Park. The Lytle Park guidelines do not address demolition of district structures.

Mr. Forwood showed revised plans that propose a three-story, 70-car parking structure facing Butler Street at the rear of the site. The garage will form a platform for a new two-story gallery wing above. The new addition matches the height of the existing building; roof and siding materials, windows and details reflect those of the main building. He said a smaller, single-story catering pavilion along the south property line would serve a paved patio atop the garage and a formal garden at grade.

Work on the Taft Museum itself is restricted to minor changes to the rear porch and north wall of the existing addition. The present entryway and service door on the north elevation will be closed with tripartite windows. The primary museum entrance has been relocated from the existing building to a glazed entryway in the new wing. All other work on the house will be in kind

to match the existing. In order to provide access for fire equipment, the front gates will be removed and new gates fabricated to match the existing ones.

Staff recommended approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness as meeting the Lytle Park Historic District guidelines.

Ms. Borys reported that the HCB committee had considered the whole design not just that portion visible from Lytle Park. She said that the committee felt the design was sensitive to the historic building in materials, proportion and detail and an improvement over that initially heard by the Board.

Ms. Anne Beha and Mr. Peter Hoyt of Anne Beha Architects and Mr. Barry Burdick of KZF Design were present to answer questions from the Board. Ms. Beha showed a model of the proposed project and explained that her firm had sought to incorporate the proportions and materials of the Taft Museum into the new addition. She said that the new roof would be copper to match the existing building and would similarly rest on a brick base. The complex would be painted based on an earlier paint analysis.

Mr. Phillip Long, director of the Taft Museum, indicated that the museum had not been renovated since 1932 and that the new wing was necessary to accommodate an expansion of its programs. Ms. Beha also showed an alternative design for a portion of the north elevation that reduced a portion of the new addition to a single story. Ms. Beha explained that this modification was being considered as a cost-reducing measure and had not been reviewed by the committee. There was general agreement that the two-story scheme was preferable and that there may be little cost savings in the one-story variation.

In answer to Mr. Senhauser, Ms. Beha said that her firm had conducted a detailed study of the bay system of the existing house and interpreted the proportions in the new wing. She said within the ordered system, she had incorporated anomalies such as odd, uncentered windows and openings related to interior uses.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Kreider, second by Raser) to take the following actions:

1. Find that the changes to the exterior of the Taft Museum as seen from Lytle Park are compatible with the historic building and grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed changes to the existing building;
2. Find that the proposed changes to the entry gates and landscaping on the Pike Street side of the property (visible from Lytle Park) are compatible with the house and neighborhood and are necessary to provide proper access to the new garage and site and approve a Certificate of

Appropriateness for the modifications to the entry gates and fence as proposed;

3. Find that either of the two presented options for the proposed addition to the museum is compatible in design, scale and materials to the original building (as seen from Lytle Park) and approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new parking structure and exhibition wing as proposed;
4. Find that the retaining wall and garage facing Butler Street (at the rear of the site) are non-contributing to the historic district and that there is no reasonable alternative to their demolition and approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for their demolition in order to achieve the overall expansion plan; and
5. Condition the approvals cited above on the review and acceptance of the final plans and specifications by the Urban Conservator as consistent with the schematic design documents approved by the HCB's action.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 1114 RACE STREET, OVER-
THE-RHINE (SOUTH) HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented the staff report on a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new penthouse addition and storefront at 1114 Race Street. The commercial building contributes to the Over-the-Rhine historic district. Ms. Cowden said that although the storefront is still covered by plywood, it is evident that it is deteriorated and has been modified. The applicant proposes to entirely remove the existing storefront and to install a new one in galvanized steel. The second floor front windows will be repaired or replaced to match and a new penthouse with galvanized sheathing will be added to the rear. Staff recommended that the project be approved on the condition that the galvanized storefront and penthouse be painted, that the storefront transoms be maintained and the entry door redesigned.

Brian Rainer and Kevin Kincer representing the owner/architect were present to answer questions from the Board. Mr. Kincer acknowledged that the OHPO had raised similar issues as part of its Tax Act review. He said that the transoms were beyond repair and would be replaced. The new storefront would be unpainted galvanized steel to reflect the industrial character of the former automobile showroom and reduce maintenance. Mr. Kincer said he had not been able to locate an historic photograph of the building.

Mr. Senhauser said he did not object to the galvanized steel, diamond plate or entry door that concerned staff. Ms. Borys agreed that the recessed doors

are acceptable as a crafted item and the galvanized storefront a compatible new design of materials found within the district.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Kreider, second by Raser) to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation, new storefront and penthouse addition to 1114 Race Street as presented with the following conditions:

1. The second floor terra cotta work be retained and repaired to match;
2. The design and proportion of the first floor transoms be incorporated in the new storefront design;
3. The owner consider painting the penthouse addition; and
4. The final construction drawings and proposed exterior finishes and elements be submitted to the Urban Conservator for approval prior to construction.

ADJOURNMENT

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned.

William L. Forwood
Urban Conservator

John C. Senhauser
Chairman

Date